

# PLANNING COMMITTEE REPORT



# ISLINGTON

Development Management Service  
Planning and Development Division  
Environment and Regeneration Department  
PO Box 333  
222 Upper Street  
LONDON N1 1YA

<b>PLANNING COMMITTEE</b>		
<b>Date: 22 July 2014</b>		<b>NON-EXEMPT</b>

Application number	P2013/4353/AOD
Application type	Approval of Details
Wards	Highbury West, Finsbury Park & Holloway
Listed building	No
Conservation area	No
Development Plan Context	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>- Queensland Road: Site Allocation HC5, Highbury Corner &amp; Holloway Road Key Area;</li><li>- Hornsey Road: Local Flood Risk Zone;</li><li>- Sobell Centre: Nags Head &amp; Upper Holloway Road Key Area, Local Flood Risk Zone;</li><li>- Hornsey Street: Protected Vista – Alexandra Palace to St Paul’s Cathedral</li></ul>
Licensing Implications	No
Site Address	Emirates Stadium, Drayton Park, Islington, London, N5 1BU  Coach Parking Locations: Queensland Road Hornsey Road Sobell Centre Hornsey Street Finsbury Park (LB Haringey)

Proposal	<p>Approval of details pursuant to condition AG16 (Arsenal event day coach parking locations) of planning permission ref: P061170.</p> <p>Condition AG16 of planning permission ref: P061170 states:</p> <p>'That during any major event, at least 40 coach parking spaces shall be made available for use within the stadium or at another location(s) outside the stadium previously agreed by the Council'</p> <p>The proposed parking locations in order of priority:</p> <p>Queensland Road (18 spaces)  Hornsey Road (9 spaces)  Sobell Centre (12 spaces)  Hornsey Street (11 spaces)  Finsbury Park (90+ spaces)</p> <p>The applicant is seeking a permanent permission.</p>
----------	--

Case Officer	Ben Dixon
Applicant	Arsenal Football Club (AFC)
Agent	Savills

## 1. RECOMMENDATION

The Committee is asked to resolve to **GRANT** permission for the approval of details on a temporary basis for a period of two football seasons up until the end of the 2018/19 season:

1. subject to the conditions set out in Appendix 1; and
2. conditional upon the prior completion of a Deed of Planning Obligation made under section 106 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 securing the heads of terms as set out in Appendix 1.



### **3. SUMMARY**

- 3.1 In summary, it is considered that subject to the associated amenity and highways impacts being appropriately mitigated by the controls set out in the LAMP, the proposed coach parking arrangements, with locations set out in the order of priority as proposed, represent the best option currently available, which would present the least harmful and most practical solution to the on-going issue of match day coach parking requirements at this current time (and in the medium term going forward).
- 3.2 As noted by the Planning Inspector in his appeal decision, given the current reliance on locations for coach parking that are not under the control of AFC and the possibility that circumstances may change, it is considered that it is appropriate to grant a 2 year temporary permission rather than a permanent permission for the coach parking arrangements as sought under this application.
- 3.3 A temporary permission would necessitate submission of a future application thereby allowing continuing up-to-date monitoring and review of associated amenity and highways impacts, so as to ensure the least harmful coach parking arrangement is able to be pursued. This approach would potentially allow for the possibility of other locations and different orders of priority of the current locations to be explored in the future.

### **4. SITE AND SURROUNDING**

- 4.1 The proposed off-site coach parking locations for match days are as follows (in order of priority):

#### Queensland Road

- 4.2 Queensland Road is a cul-de-sac located to the south of the Emirates Stadium, accessed from the east side of Benwell Road. Queensland Road has been used as the first priority location for coach parking for all 8 football seasons since the Emirates Stadium opened in 2006. It is proposed to use both sides of Queensland Road to provide capacity to park up to 18 coaches on match days.
- 4.3 Large scale redevelopment on either side of Queensland Road forms part of the wider Arsenal regeneration programme. The six storey residential development on the south side of Queensland Road is completed and occupied. The predominantly residential (mixed-use) development on the north side of Queensland Road ranges from 10 storeys to 15 storeys. The north side development is part complete and partly still under construction, with the first residents having recently taken up occupancy in early 2014 and the development is due to be completed and fully occupied by the end of 2015. When completed the whole development will provide 729 residential properties.

#### Hornsey Road

- 4.4 Hornsey Road (A103) runs north from Holloway Road passing adjacent to the west side of the Emirates Stadium. This application relates to the section of Hornsey Road to the northwest of the Emirates Stadium, located between the railway bridge

and the cross-roads junction with Tollington Road (A503). It is proposed to use the east side of this section of Hornsey Road to provide capacity to park up to 9 coaches on match days.

- 4.5 This section of Hornsey Road is currently subject to match day parking restrictions to enable safe spectator movement in the carriageway prior to and immediately following matches. This section is also currently used by the Metropolitan Police Service (MPS) to park a limited number of their match day support vehicles.
- 4.6 To the east of the proposed coach parking is the Harvist Estate, comprising low rise and high rise blocks of flats. To the west are three storey residential terraces.

#### Sobell Centre

- 4.7 The Sobell Centre is a council owned leisure facility located approximately 500m to the northwest of the Emirates Stadium at the northeast corner of the cross-roads junction of Hornsey Road (A103) and Tollington Road (A503). The Sobell Centre comprises a large indoor sports complex across the centre of the site, with two recently constructed small-sided astro-turf football pitches to the southwest corner of the site and a large car park across the north side. The centre provides facilities for a multitude of sports and activities including: badminton, gym, group exercise classes, climbing, small sided football, ice skating, and squash. The main entrance to the building is on the south side, where there is a separate car park for disabled people. The Sobell Centre has been used for the parking of 12 (and previously up to 18) coaches on match days for previous football seasons. It is proposed to use the east side of the main car park to provide capacity to park up to 12 coaches on match days.
- 4.8 Adjacent to the east of the main car park is a two storey council owned office building. Adjacent to the north of the car park are three storey residential terraces at Thane Villas and Drummer Lodge, together with a small public park known as Kinloch Gardens.

#### Hornsey Street

- 4.9 Hornsey Street is a cul-de-sac with a 7m wide carriageway located to the southwest of Holloway Road (A1). To the southwestern end of the road is a mini-roundabout, which provides vehicular access to the Islington Waste Recycling Centre. Hornsey Street is located approximately 500m to the southwest of the Emirates Stadium and is outside the match day traffic restriction zone. The northwest side of Hornsey Street has previously been used for the parking of up to 13 coaches as the third / fourth priority location. It is proposed to use the northwest side of Hornsey Street to provide capacity to park up to 11 coaches on match days.
- 4.10 Large scale development on either side of Hornsey Street forms part of the wider Arsenal regeneration programme. The buildings on Hornsey Street are generally large, range up to 12 storeys in height, and comprise commercial uses at ground floor level with residential units on the upper floors.

## Finsbury Park

- 4.11 Finsbury Park is a large public open space providing facilities for a wide variety of formal and informal sports and activities. Finsbury Park has been used for coach parking in exceptional circumstances in previous football seasons.
- 4.12 Finsbury Park is located just outside the borough within the London Borough of Haringey. Haringey Council has confirmed in writing to Arsenal Football Club (AFC) that it will continue to permit the use of Finsbury Park for coach parking in exceptional circumstances for the 2014/15 season and beyond.

## **5. PROPOSAL (IN DETAIL)**

- 5.1 Arsenal Football Club (AFC) is seeking to secure a permanent permission for matchday coach parking locations for the 2014/15 football season and beyond, as required by condition AG16 attached to the Emirates Stadium planning permission (ref: P061170). Condition AG16 reads as follows:

*“That during any major event, at least 40 coach parking spaces shall be made available within the stadium or at other location(s) outside the stadium previously agreed by Council.”*

- 5.2 Since the opening of the Emirates Stadium in 2006, over the past 8 football seasons, AFC have operated match day coach parking under several temporary permissions. AFC are now seeking to secure a permanent permission for the designated coach parking locations as proposed under this application.
- 5.3 The proposed coach parking locations are set out below in order of priority of use:
- Queensland Road – Up to 18 coach parking spaces distributed on both the north and south sides of the road;
  - Hornsey Road – Up to 9 coach parking spaces on the east side of the road;
  - Sobell Centre – Up to 12 coach parking spaces within the east side of the north car park;
  - Hornsey Street – Up to 11 coach parking spaces on the north side of the road (only to be used for a maximum of 2 matches during any one season unless further required by the Metropolitan Police Service);
  - Finsbury Park – 90+ spaces along the kerbside of the park’s internal roads (only to be used in exceptional circumstances).
- 5.4 In terms of the order in which the proposed locations would be used, all coaches would be first directed to Queensland Road until it reaches its 18 coach capacity, at which point any additional coaches would then be directed to Hornsey Road. The Sobell Centre would then be used if Hornsey Road has reached its capacity of 9 coaches. If the 12 available spaces at the Sobell Centre are taken and further capacity is required, then Hornsey Street would be used to accommodate up to

another 11 coaches, with Finsbury Park providing further additional capacity in exceptional circumstances.

- 5.5 However, notwithstanding the above stated order of priority, the order in which the coach parking locations are used on any particular match day, may on occasion be subject to alterations by the Metropolitan Police Service (MPS) Match Day Commander (in consultation with the Council), as deemed necessary for public safety and security reasons.
- 5.6 In terms of the management of spectator coaches, AFC, in conjunction with the MPS, operate a spectator coach booking system for all groups intending to travel by coach to the Emirates Stadium on a match day. Coach operators are required to register beforehand with AFC in order to reserve a coach parking space at one of the designated sites. Coaches are required to arrive no later than two hours before the scheduled kick-off. Coaches that arrive late or without booking, will normally be turned away. However, this is at the discretion of the MPS Match Day Commander who in exceptional circumstances will allow late arriving or unregistered coaches to park in one of the designated coach parking locations when it is deemed to be in the interests of spectator and public safety.
- 5.7 There are four main differences between the current proposal and the previous temporary permission covering the previous 2 football seasons:
- i) A new on-street location is proposed on Hornsey Road to the northwest of the Emirates Stadium, which would be second in the order of priority of use, providing coach parking capacity for up to 9 coaches.
  - ii) The Sobell Centre would move from second in the order of priority of coach parking locations to third, with a predicted reduction in its use from previous seasons.
  - iii) The site on Drayton Park, which previously formed part of the coach parking locations, has been removed from the proposal, as it does not meet the operational requirements of the Police.
  - iv) The previous permissions for coach parking covering the past 8 football seasons have all been temporary. AFC are now seeking a permanent permission for the coach parking locations as proposed under this application.

**Table 1: Frequency of use of coach parking locations – All home football matches**

Location	Frequency							
	2008/09	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12	2012/13	2013/14	2014/15 <i>(predicted)</i>	Change from 2013/14
Queensland Rd	31	29	30	31	26	31	31	0
Sobell Centre	7	7	7	12	7	6	3	-3
Hornsey Street	1	1	0	0	0	0	2	+2
Drayton Park	1	0	0	0	0	0	n/a	0
Finsbury Park	1	0	3	2	2	3	3	0
Hornsey Road	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	9	14	+5



- 5.8 The proposed arrangements for coach parking would only cover football matches. Other (non-football) events may also fall into the major events category (defined in the Stadium S106 as an event attended by 10,000 spectators or more) but coach parking for these events is controlled by the Local Area Management Plan (LAMP) and is not covered by this application.
- 5.9 The original planning permission for the Stadium (ref: P011500) was subject to condition AG27 which limited the number of non-football major events to not more than 6 events in a 12 month period. Of these 6 major events, a maximum of 3 could be music concerts. Monitoring of coach numbers associated with past non-football major events that have occurred at the Stadium to date indicate that non-football major events are unlikely to result in demand for coach parking in excess of the proposed 18 coach capacity at Queensland Road. Therefore, only Queensland Road would be utilised for these events.

## **6. RELEVANT HISTORY:**

- 6.1 In May 2002 planning permission (ref: P011500) was granted for AFC to erect a new 60,000 seat stadium – The Emirates Stadium. This permission included outline permission for the wider Arsenal regeneration scheme including the redevelopment of Queensland Road.
- 6.2 Attached to the planning permission ref: P011500 was condition AG16 which stipulated:
- "At least 40 coach parking spaces shall be made available for use within the stadium during any major event".*
- 6.3 The 40 coach parking spaces to be provided within the Stadium development were to be split with 24 spaces provided within the Stadium undercroft and at least 16 spaces provided below the Queensland Road part of the wider redevelopment proposals.
- 6.4 However, by the time the Stadium opened in 2006, the terrorist threat warning level in the UK had increased from the warning level at the time when the Stadium was originally designed and granted planning permission (2000 to 2002). Consequently, it was deemed necessary for the MPS to re-assess the potential terrorist threat levels related to the operation of the Stadium in the interests of public safety.
- 6.5 Whilst the 24 spaces within the Stadium undercroft were constructed when the Stadium was constructed, since 2005 (before the Stadium was opened), the MPS Counter Terrorism Security Advisors have consistently advised that spectator coaches should not be parked within the undercroft of the Stadium as was originally envisaged. At the same time, procedural delays in the Queensland Road development prevented the intended undercroft coach parking space in this part of the redevelopment scheme from being brought forward.



6.6 As a result of the advice provided by the MPS, preventing the use of undercroft parking at the Stadium, it was necessary to vary the wording of condition AG16. This was approved by the Council in March 2006 (ref: P052891). The variation of condition AG16 removed the requirement to provide coach parking in the Stadium undercroft by allowing the alternative of parking coaches at agreed locations near the Stadium. Condition AG16 was amended to read:

*"That during a major event, at least 40 coach parking spaces shall be made available for use within the stadium or at other locations outside the stadium as previously agreed by the council."*

6.7 Arrangements for coach parking for the first football season at the Emirates Stadium in 2006/07, in accordance with amended condition AG16, were approved by the Council in March 2006. The agreed coach parking locations were (in order of priority):

- Queensland Road (23 spaces);
- Sobell Centre (18 spaces);
- Hornsey Street (14 spaces);
- Drayton Park (9 spaces); and
- Finsbury Park (90+ spaces for exceptional use only).

6.8 Extensions to these temporary arrangements were subsequently agreed in June 2007 (ref: P071058) and June 2008 (ref: P080954) to cover the following 2007/08 and 2008/09 football seasons.

6.9 In July 2009 planning permission (ref: P082018) was granted for a revised detailed comprehensive redevelopment scheme for Queensland Road. The description of the approved development is:

*'Demolition of existing buildings and redevelopment of the site, realignment of Queensland Road (which involves stopping up the existing road) and development of one new building to the north and one to the south. The building to the south would be up to six storeys high and provide 213 residential units and 345sqm of commercial space, with a mix of class A1 (shops), A2 (financial and professional services), A3 (restaurants and cafes), A4 (drinking establishments), B1 (business), D1 (non-residential) & D2 (leisure). The building to the north would incorporate five towers providing 10 to 15 floors of residential accommodation above a plinth of mainly commercial space. It would provide 516 residential units, 1,600sqm of sports centre for Arsenal Football Club and 1,330sqm of commercial space with a mix of class A1/A2/A3/A4/B1 as described above and 179 car parking spaces.'*

6.10 A condition was attached to planning permission ref: P082018 to secure on-street coach parking provision on Queensland Road. Condition 65 states:

*"...The revised detailed layout shall contain provision for 14 coach parking spaces along the entire length of both the north and southern sides of the realigned Queensland Road."*

6.11 Three planning applications [ref: P011500(AG16a), P011500(AG16b) and P011500(AG16c)] seeking temporary permission for coach parking arrangements

for the 2009/10, 2010/11 and 2011/12 football seasons were submitted by AFC in November 2008 and April 2009. These applications were all refused by the Council in March and June 2009. The stated reason for refusal was:

REASON: The proposed coach parking locations are considered unacceptable due to their impact on the amenity of existing residents, there is also a lack of information provided as to other alternative sites that may have a lesser impact, and consequently the failure to propose a long-term solution. This is contrary to policies Env12, Env17, T55, and V7 of the Islington Unitary Development Plan (2002) and policies 3C.1, 3C.2, 3C.4 and 3C.24 of the London Plan (Consolidated with Alterations since 2004).

- 6.12 The refusal of these applications [ref: P011500(AG16a), P011500(AG16b) and P011500(AG16c)] was subsequently appealed by AFC. The appeals which were heard at a public inquiry were allowed by the Inspector in August 2009. The Inspector granted a three year temporary planning permission allowing coach parking to be provided in specific locations around the Stadium, in line with revised condition AG16, to cover football matches played until the end of the 2011/12 season. This was subject to the following condition:

*“Coach parking at Hornsey Street and Drayton Park South shall be limited to not more than twice per year for each location unless increased usage is required for safety and/or security reasons by the Metropolitan Police Service in consultation with the London Borough of Islington.”*

- 6.13 The coach parking locations approved by the Inspector for the 2009/10, 2010/11 and 2011/12 seasons were (in order of priority):
- Queensland Road (23 spaces prior to construction, 14 spaces during construction, 14 spaces post construction);
  - Sobell Centre (18 spaces);
  - Hornsey Street (11 spaces in rotation with Drayton Park to be determined by the Council in conjunction with the MPS);
  - Drayton Park (8 spaces in rotation with Hornsey Street to be determined by the Council in conjunction with the MPS); and
  - Finsbury Park (90+ spaces in exceptional circumstances).
- 6.14 The Inspector stated in his reasoning (para. 16 of appeal decision), *‘It may be highly desirable to all concerned to agree a long term solution to coach parking in association with use of the stadium. It may also be preferable that all or most of the provision should be off-street and controlled by Arsenal FC. Those are not however requirements of the amended condition. I must therefore make my decision on this appeal on the basis of the wording of the amended condition.’*
- 6.15 The Inspector stated (para. 19 of appeal decision) *‘Given the circumstances that have led to the current situation I consider the list of locations proposed in this appeal represents the optimal solution at the present time. Any permission would therefore need to be time limited in order to review the situation in the light of possible changes in circumstances and also in the light of on-going monitoring of impact.’*

- 6.16 The Inspector also stated (para. 22 of appeal decision) *'The appeal proposals even when subject to the above controls, do not represent a solution to the coach parking requirements of the Emirates Stadium that can be expected to result in the same or less impact on residential amenity as the original proposals to use the stadium undercroft and Queensland Road. I am however satisfied that the investigative exercise that led to this short term solution being proposed was comprehensive and represents the best that can be achieved at the moment. Unless locations can be found off-street that are controlled by Arsenal FC it is however likely that future proposals to satisfy the amended Condition AG16 will similarly need to be promoted as a relatively short-term measures.'*
- 6.17 In May 2012, the Planning Committee granted a temporary two year permission [ref: P052891(AG16)] to allow coach parking for the 2012/13 and 2013/14 football seasons. The agreed coach parking locations were as follows (in order of priority):
- Queensland Road (18 spaces)
  - Sobell Centre (12 spaces)
  - Hornsey Street (11 spaces in rotation with Drayton Park to be determined by the Council in conjunction with the MPS)
  - Drayton Park (8 spaces in rotation with Hornsey Street to be determined by the Council in conjunction with the MPS)
  - Finsbury Park (90+ spaces in exceptional circumstances)
- 6.18 The approved arrangements were subject to conditions ensuring the rotation of the use of Hornsey Street and Drayton Park on the occasions when their capacity / use was required, and limiting the use of Hornsey Street and Drayton Park to a maximum of twice per football season.
- 6.19 The S106 legal agreement attached to the Stadium permission (ref: P011500) secured a Stadium Management Plan (SMP) which contains agreed details for the control of the Stadium's operation. The SMP is an overarching document which covers all the public safety, crime prevention and local transport management issues (including monitoring and reducing the impact on the amenity of local residents) for all match days, major event days and non-event days.
- 6.20 The SMP includes a Local Area Management Plan (LAMP) which specifically deals with the management and control of coach parking and all traffic management controls in the area surrounding the Stadium, leading up to, during and following football matches and other major events. The LAMP includes a monitoring function and seeks to minimise adverse environmental impacts and nuisance for local residents and businesses, arising from the operation of Emirates Stadium and associated measures required to maintain public safety.
- 6.21 The measures, secured within the LAMP, to control and minimise the potential impacts of coach parking, include providing an adequate number of trained stewards at each coach parking location in order to ensure that coach parking takes place with minimum disruption. The stewards would provide direct management of coaches as they arrive to park and during the game (ensuring engines remain switched off), and management of spectators as they disembark and arrive back at the coaches ready to embark after the match. There is a

requirement that the SMP and LAMP are periodically updated. The process of updating these documents is currently underway with the updated documents due to be completed prior to the commencement of the upcoming 2014/15 football season.

## 7. CONSULTATION

### Public Consultation

- 7.1 There is no statutory duty to consult residents on an approval of details applications such as this. However, it has been the practice to do so, as part of the consideration of coach parking arrangements for previous seasons, given the potential impact upon the amenity of local residents.
- 7.2 Letters were sent out on 29<sup>th</sup> November 2013 to approximately 5200 properties that surround the 5 proposed coach parking locations. Letters were also left at the front desk of the Sobell Centre. Site notices were displayed at each of the proposed coach parking locations on the 5<sup>th</sup> December 2013. A press notice was also published on the same date.
- 7.3 The standard length of the public consultation period for planning applications is normally 21 days. However, taking into account the fact that the consultation period fell shortly before Christmas, when people would be likely to be busier than normal, an extended public consultation period was provided running until 6<sup>th</sup> January 2014. This was done so as to provide ample time for interested parties to provide comments in response to the coach parking proposals. Residents who have moved into Queensland Road since January 2014 would not have been consulted on this application. However, notwithstanding this, it is the Council's practice to continue to consider representations received up until the date of a decision.
- 7.4 At the time of the writing of this report a total of 33 responses had been received from the public with regard to the application. 31 of the responses set out objections to the proposals and 2 responses provided comments but did not raise objections. Table 2 below provides details of the main location which each objection relates to:

**Table 2 – Details of locations to which objections relate**

Location	Number of Objections
General Objection	12
Hornsey Road	7
Queensland Road	6
Hornsey Street	5
Finsbury Park	1

7.5 The issues raised regarding the proposed coach parking arrangements are summarised below (with the paragraph that provides responses to each issue indicated within brackets):

#### 7.6 General Objections

- All coaches should be parked under the stadium and not on the street as originally planned when the stadium was permitted (9.14-9.45);
- Coaches will cause increased traffic and congestion on match days (9.47, 9.58, 9.71, 9.84, 10.3);
- Coach parking will cause a reduction in parking spaces available / increase demand for parking spaces for residents and their guests (10.14);
- The proposal is detrimental to highway safety in the area (9.47, 9.58, 9.84, 9.71);
- The parking of coaches is not in-keeping with the character of the primarily residential area surrounding the stadium (10.14);
- Coach engines are left running while parked causing air and noise pollution (9.48); and
- A permanent permission would not allow the situation to be reviewed in light of experience and changing circumstances (10.16 – 10.17).

#### 7.7 Queensland Road

- The proposal will result in reduced safety and security for residents of Queensland Road (9.59-9.64, 10.14);
- Spectators will loiter on Queensland Road (9.62);
- The proposal will cause increased levels of noise, anti-social behaviour and environmental degradation on Queensland Road (9.60-9.62, 9.64);
- Due to the narrow width of Queensland Road, parking coaches would result in a loss of amenity to residents due to reduced privacy and noise and disturbance (9.60-9.62, 9.64);
- The proposal would result in increased vehicular and pedestrian traffic on Queensland Road (9.58, 9.60-9.62, 9.64);
- The parking of 18 coaches would harm the character and appearance of Queensland Road (10.14);
- Queensland Road is becoming a densely populated residential street (9.59-9.64); and

- The Queensland Road development has not been completed, therefore there will be future residents that have not been consulted regarding coach parking (10.16-10.17).

## 7.8 Hornsey Road

- A large number of stewards / police would be required to prevent fans from entering the Harvist Estate (9.73-9.77);
- The proposal would cause increased levels of anti-social behaviour such as urination, hooliganism and vandalism in and adjacent to the Harvist Estate (9.73-9.77);
- The proposal would result in reduced safety for residents of the Harvist Estate (9.73-9.77);
- The proposal would result in reduced privacy for residents of the Harvist Estate (9.73-9.77);
- The proposal would result in increased noise from the fans alighting and boarding coaches, and coaches arriving and leaving including after 10pm for mid-week matches (9.73-9.77); and
- Coaches would be parked close to The Tollington public house where home fans drink before during and after the game, which could be a potential flash point for trouble if these are coaches for away fans (9.75).

## 7.9 Sobell Centre

- Arsenal coaches previously parked in the segregated coach parking area, however, this has now been developed to provide football pitches, therefore, the coaches would now have to be parked in the main customer car park (9.80, 9.82, 9.86-9.89);
- 12 coach parking spaces would result in the loss of almost half the customer car parking (54 of 123) spaces on match days (9.80, 9.82, 9.86-9.89);
- The reduced availability of parking will put people off from using the Sobell Centre on match days or at least force them to park elsewhere (9.80, 9.82, 9.86-9.89);
- The reduction in customer car parking is exacerbated due to fans and local residents (whose parking spaces on Hornsey Road have been suspended) taking up the remaining parking spaces (9.80, 9.82, 9.86-9.89);
- The loss of car parking spaces would result in a loss of income to the Sobell Centre as a result of reduced parking revenue and also from less people using the centre (9.89); and

- The proposal would result in increased problems with drug dealers and prostitutes using the Sobell Centre car park seeking business from fans arriving by coach (9.93).

7.10 A petition objecting to the proposal signed by 226 Sobell Centre users and local residents has also been received. The grounds of objection raised by the petition can be summarised as follows:

- The proposal to park coaches at the Sobell Centre and on Hornsey Road would be harmful to local residents and to the users of the Sobell Centre (9.65-9.93);
- The proposals would result in increased parking difficulty for local residents and Sobell Centre users (9.86-9.89).

#### 7.11 Hornsey Street

- There is a high density of residents on Hornsey Street (9.95-9.97, 9.108-9.111);
- Hornsey Street is too narrow to accommodate coach parking (9.98-9.106);
- Hornsey Street is already used by large trucks servicing the waste recycling centre which struggle to pass each other even without coach parking (9.98-9.106);
- The proposal would cause increased noise and anti-social behaviour on Hornsey Street (9.107-9.111, 10.14);
- The parking of 11 coaches would harm the character and appearance of Hornsey Street (10.14); and
- Rollit Street is a short cut from Hornsey Street / Holloway Road, resulting in anti-social behaviour such as urinating, littering and threatening behaviour occurring on this street (10.14).

#### 7.12 Finsbury Park

- Finsbury Park is a public open space which is a great resource for enjoyment by local residents and visitors. Parking coaches there would harm and detract from the quality of this resource (9.112-9.115).

### **External Consultees**

7.13 Metropolitan Police Service (Designing Out Crime Officer): – has advised that this is being handled by the Arsenal Football Unit based at Islington Police Station.



- 7.14 Metropolitan Police Service (Match Day Commander):- supports the proposed coach parking arrangements.
- 7.15 Metropolitan Police Service (Counter Terrorism): - has advised that coaches should not be parked within the Stadium undercroft due to this posing an unacceptable terrorist threat.
- 7.16 Safety Advisory Group (SAG):- SAG is a multi-disciplinary group which includes representatives from the Police, London Fire Brigade, medical and London Ambulance Service, TfL and the Council) proposed coach parking arrangements were discussed at the Safety Advisory Group meeting held on 13<sup>th</sup> July 2014. SAG support the proposed coach parking arrangements for the reasons set out below:
- 7.17 The key safety issue in relation to coach parking is to be able to move visiting supporters (especially when high risk games are taking place) from their coaches into the stadium quickly and with as limited contact with home supporters as is possible. This then limits the opportunity for flash points and adverse impacts on local residents. The Queensland Road location is adjacent to the access ramp for away supporters and they can easily be moved from that location into the dedicated turnstiles for the away area. In all the stadium safety discussions, Queensland Road has always been envisaged to be the key coach parking location and has worked very well for all agencies. Hornsey Road is a new location that has been trialled during last season. The advantage it has over Sobell is the shorter distance to bring supporters from the stadium and the ability to drive coaches away immediately. It has been used for high risk games, especially European fixtures, and proved very successful with stewarding and policing used to ensure separation and no dispersal into residential areas. Overall, incidents relating to coach parking – including resident complaints - are very low and the SAG believes that this is because of the consideration that has been given to their location. The police are making their own representation on this application but the SAG was made aware that policing of football stadiums and when and where this takes place is subject to a number of legal cases across the country. At the moment, the guiding case has determined that they can only be paid and required to police within the footprint of the stadium. Coach parking at Arsenal is currently managed by a mixture of police and stewards and the further coach parking is moved from the stadium, the more vulnerable the continuation of a police presence is.
- 7.18 Transport for London (TfL): – have advised, it is accepted that adequate coach parking will need to be provided and managed within a reasonable walking distance to the stadium. However, there are concerns about the permanent approval of Hornsey Street for coach parking, due to the requirement for coaches to have to undertake a three-point turn on a mini-roundabout and turn onto the Transport for London Road Network (TLRN) when exiting Hornsey Street. However, no objection is raised to the temporary inclusion of Hornsey Street and if monitoring demonstrates that it is required as additional capacity then no objection would be raised to it being included as a permanent location.
- 7.19 London Borough of Haringey – have confirmed that they would support the use Finsbury Park for coach parking as required in exceptional circumstances.

7.20 London Borough of Hackney did not provide a response.

### **Internal Consultees**

7.21 Spatial Planning and Transport (Transport Officer): – Note the advice of the Police Counter Terrorism Unit that coaches should not be parked in the Stadium undercroft. Subject to operation of coach parking at the proposed locations in accordance with the controls set out in the LAMP, and that on-going operational issues continue to be addressed as they arise, no transport objection is raised. The grant of this permission should not prejudice the continued work of the Club and the Council (and other key stakeholders) to secure more appropriate coach parking locations.

7.22 Licensing: - No objection.

7.23 Leisure Services:- Coach parking for Arsenal at the Sobell Centre has been maintained at 12 coach bays on matchdays. The council has developed the former school bus parking area to provide active football pitches that add value to the local leisure offer and increase the participation figures at the centre. This development restricts the flexibility that the centre previously had of offering up to 18 coach parking bays and this is now not possible. 12 coach parking bays are the maximum that the site can provide as more than this would affect public access to the centre. Any future proposals would need to ensure that this is factored in and the 12 bays should form the maximum ceiling of any future application. The primary business at the Sobell Centre has been increased and it is therefore imperative that centre users are not compromised by matchday parking arrangements.

7.24 Public Protection (Noise): – There have not been any registered noise complaints for some time relating to coach parking. The main previous issue has been due to the coaches leaving their engines idling. However, the parking of coaches seems to be appropriately managed by AFC and their stewards. Therefore, the Pollution Team has no objections provided the current management plan and stewarding remains in place.

### **Other Consultees**

7.25 The application was presented to Members' Pre-application Forum on 17 October 2013.

## **8. RELEVANT POLICIES**

8.1 Details of all relevant policies and guidance notes are attached as Appendix 2. This report considers the proposal against the NPPF and the following development plan documents.

### **National Guidance**

- 8.2 The National Planning Policy Framework 2012 seeks to secure positive growth in a way that effectively balances economic, environmental and social progress for current and future generations. The NPPF is a material consideration and has been taken into account as part of the assessment of these proposals.

### **Development Plan**

- 8.3 The Development Plan is comprised of the London Plan 2011, Islington Core Strategy 2011, Development Management Policies 2013, Finsbury Local Plan 2013 and Site Allocations 2013. The policies of the Development Plan that are considered relevant to this application are listed at Appendix 2 to this report.

### **Designations**

- 8.4 The proposed coach parking locations have the following designations under the London Plan 2011, Islington Core Strategy 2011, Development Management Policies 2013, Finsbury Local Plan 2013 and Site Allocations 2013:

Queensland Road: Site Allocation HC5, Highbury Corner & Holloway Road Key Area;

Hornsey Road: Local Flood Risk Zone;

Sobell Centre: Nags Head & Upper Holloway Road Key Area, Local Flood Risk Zone;

Hornsey Street: Protected Vista – Alexandra Palace to St Paul’s Cathedral

### **Supplementary Planning Guidance (SPG) / Document (SPD)**

- 8.5 The SPGs and/or SPDs which are considered relevant are listed in Appendix 2.

## **9. ASSESSMENT**

- 9.1 The main issues arising from this proposal relate to:

- Public Safety
- Residential Amenity
- Transportation

### **Background**

- 9.2 When allowing a temporary permission for coach parking arrangements for 3 football seasons up until the end of the 2011/12 season, the Inspector stated (para. 16 of appeal decision) ‘*It may be highly desirable to all concerned to agree a long*

*term solution to coach parking in association with use of the stadium. It may also be preferable that all or most of the provision should be off-street and controlled by Arsenal FC. Those are not however requirements of the amended condition (AG16). I must therefore make my decision on this appeal on the basis of the wording of the amended condition.'*

- 9.3 It is necessary to consider the proposal for coach parking arrangements put forward under this current application on the basis of the requirements set out in the wording of amended condition AG16 which states:

*"That during a major event, at least 40 coach parking spaces shall be made available for use within the stadium or at other locations outside the stadium as previously agreed by the council."*

### **Coach Parking Demand**

- 9.4 The number of spectator coaches attracted to each football match held at the Emirates Stadium has been recorded as part of the Stadium Monitoring Programme that is secured as part of the Stadium S106 legal agreement.
- 9.5 The number of times that each of the approved coach parking locations was used during the previous football seasons from 2006/07 to the most recent season 2013/14 is summarised in Table 3 below.

**Table 3: Frequency of use of coach parking locations – All home football matches**

Location	Frequency							
	2006/07	2007/08	2008/09	2009/10	2010/11	2011/12	2012/13	2013/14
Queensland Rd	30	30	31	29	30	31	26	31
Sobell Centre	6	12	7	7	7	12	7	6
Hornsey Street	1	3	1	1	0	0	0	0
Drayton Park	0	1	1	0	0	0	0	0
Finsbury Park	0	0	1	0	3	2	2	3

- 9.6 The number of games played each season at the Emirates Stadium since it opened has been between 26 and 31. The demand for coach travel to the Emirates Stadium is dependent on a range of factors, including which opponents AFC are playing, the type of match (Premier League, FA / League Cup, European games) and the significance of the match (e.g. quarter final / semi-final of a knockout cup, or a league title / relegation decider). Consequently, the number of spectator coaches generated by football matches at the Emirates Stadium will vary from match to match and season to season.
- 9.7 Monitoring indicates that knock-out cup competitions and the UEFA Champions League fixtures generally attract the highest number of coaches carrying away fans, whereas for games involving other London teams, coach travel by away fans is typically low.

**Table 4: Average number of coaches per match for past seasons**

<b>Season</b>	<b>Average Number of Coaches per Match</b>
2008/09	21
2009/10	21
2010/11	19
2011/12	21
2012/13	18
2013/14	20

- 9.8 The average number of coaches per match at the Emirates Stadium has remained fairly constant over the past six seasons at approximately 20 coaches per match as illustrated by Table 4 above. Based on the relative consistency of the recorded figures, it is forecast that the number of coaches generated by matches played at the Emirates Stadium during future seasons will be broadly the same as those recorded during previous seasons.
- 9.9 The maximum number of coaches per game per season can exceed the capacity of 40 coaches as required to be provided by condition AG16. For example, during the 2011/12 football season for the FA Cup game where Arsenal played Aston Villa, there were a total of 78 coaches (72 coaches carrying away fans and 6 carrying home fans). The 40 coach capacity was exceeded 3 times in the 2011/12 season, once in the 2012/13 season, and once in the 2013/14 season.
- 9.10 The MPS has confirmed that, in the interests of minimising the risk of public disorder, it is considered necessary to segregate coaches carrying away supporters from coaches carrying home supporters for some fixtures. In the 2012/13 season, segregation was provided for two Premier League matches and all four Champions League games. In the 2013/14 season, segregation was provided for 6 Premier League games and one FA Cup game.
- 9.11 It is noted that (the rotated) third / fourth priority locations of Hornsey Street and Drayton Park were not used for coach parking at all during the past 4 seasons with sufficient coach parking capacity provided by the first and second priority locations of Queensland Road and the Sobell Centre, with Finsbury Park used to provide additional capacity on the two or three occasions per season when exceptionally large numbers of coaches were required to be accommodated.
- 9.12 AFC have advised that the new coach parking location at Hornsey Road that is proposed under this current application was used a total of 9 times during the previous 2013/14 football season as directed by the MPS Match Day Commander. While this site was not an approved coach parking location, it is within a match day road closure, it is included within the scope of the LAMP, and it is managed by both police officers and AFC stewards. While it is noted that this is not an ideal situation, the management of coach parking on a match by match basis is at the discretion of the MPS Match Day Commander. This current application is seeking to regularise the use of Hornsey Road as the second priority location for coach parking as requested by the MPS.

- 9.13 In summary, based on an analysis of the data for coach parking for past seasons at the Emirates Stadium, it is anticipated that there will continue to be a future requirement to maintain the existing coach parking supply for 40 coaches as required by condition AG16. It is anticipated that there will be occasional requirement for the provision of parking capacity for more than 40 coaches if AFC progress to later rounds of Cup competitions. However, it is noted that any future exceptional demand for coach parking capacity beyond 40 coaches, can comfortably be accommodated at Finsbury Park as has happened previously. This has been agreed in writing by Haringey Council.

### **Coach Parking in the Stadium Undercroft**

- 9.14 When plans to develop the Emirates Stadium were initially conceived, it was originally intended that the Stadium undercroft would accommodate the parking of up to 24 coaches, with a further 16 spaces to be provided under the Queensland Road development, providing a total capacity to accommodate up to 40 coaches within the development. However, since 2005, prior to the Stadium becoming operational, the MPS Counter Terrorism Unit have provided consistent advice with regards to the potential terrorist threat associated with allowing spectator coaches to park under the Stadium. Consequently, in light of this advice, the Stadium undercroft has never been used for the parking of spectator coaches.
- 9.15 Furthermore, procedural delays in the Queensland Road development coupled with the security concerns raised by the MPS Counter Terrorism Unit also prevented the initially intended undercroft coach parking space in this part of the redevelopment scheme from being brought forward.
- 9.16 The originally envisaged undercroft coach parking within the Queensland Road development was not incorporated within the revised Queensland Road development that was approved by the Planning Committee in July 2009 under planning permission ref: P082018. Consequently, even if coaches were able to park within the Stadium undercroft this would only provide capacity for up to 24 coaches with on-street capacity for a further 16 coaches still necessary to meet the requirements of condition AG16. Also, this would not provide the possibility for segregation of coaches carrying home and away supporters, if the coaches were to enter the Stadium undercroft laden with spectators (as required by the MPS).
- 9.17 Following requests from Councillors and neighbouring residents, the feasibility and implications of parking coaches within the Stadium undercroft have been re-explored in detail by the Council in association with AFC, the MPS Match Day Commander and the MPS Counter Terrorism Unit.
- 9.18 Working closely with the MPS, AFC has produced a report which examines the feasibility and implications of potentially parking coaches under the Stadium. The report highlights that there are a significant number of logistical and management issues associated with potentially parking coaches within the Stadium undercroft that make this arrangement unworkable. The report concludes that, even setting aside the contention that the Stadium is not designed to accommodate public access from the basement level, it would be necessary to drop-off and pick-up spectators at locations on surrounding roads outside the Stadium (see further details set out in the paragraphs below). This would result in an increased number

of coach movements in the area around the Stadium with an associated increase in disruption to the local area, above that experienced as a result of coach parking arrangements for previous seasons or those proposed under this current application.

- 9.19 The paragraphs below discuss in detail the implications of potentially parking coaches within the Stadium undercroft and why this is not considered to be a practical or viable solution to the provision of match day coach parking (in the medium term).

#### Public Access from the Stadium Undercroft

- 9.20 The implications of allowing either coaches laden with spectators, or un-laden coaches, to enter the Stadium undercroft for parking have been investigated. As a starting point, it is important to note that the original Stadium planning permission (ref: P011500) and associated Environmental Impact Assessment assumed that coaches would drop spectators off outside the Stadium prior to the match and then pick them up again outside the Stadium after the match. It is therefore the case that it was originally envisaged that only un-laden coaches would enter the Stadium undercroft.
- 9.21 At no point in the Stadium design process was it the intention to allow general public access into and out of the spectator areas of the Stadium (other than for executive club and box levels) from the undercroft. This is borne out in the fact that of the 9 stair cores into the Stadium undercroft, only one is designed to incorporate a turnstile allowing controlled access for the limited number of people accessing the executive areas. The other 8 stair cores provide service access and are unrestricted by turnstiles as is a requirement of the Stadium's emergency access strategy as set out in the Stadium Safety Certificate. Those 8 stair cores are required to remain obstruction free, as in the event of an emergency, they would serve as one of the egress points which would allow the Stadium to be fully evacuated within 8 minutes as required by the Safety Certificate.
- 9.22 It is a requirement of the Stadium Safety Certificate that any members of the public entering the Stadium must go through a turnstile. For the limited number of people that access the executive areas of the Stadium via the undercroft, this therefore has to be via the single turnstile entrance, which only provides access to the executive areas and not to the rest of the spectating areas. If turnstiles were to be installed at the other stair cores, to allow increased capacity for public access from the undercroft, this would prevent the necessary evacuation times, as required by the Safety Certificate, from being met. These cores, insofar as access to the Stadium from the undercroft is concerned, can therefore not be brought into use as general public match day access or egress except in an emergency. Consequently, if coaches laden with spectators were to enter the undercroft, the spectators would need to be led back out of the undercroft onto Queensland Road and then round to the ground floor level turnstile entrances from the Stadium podium.

#### Arrival of Coaches, Security Searches & Scanning

- 9.23 The security protocol for the Stadium requires that all vehicles entering the Stadium undercroft need to be searched prior to entry. No cars are allowed to enter



the undercroft unless they have been pre-registered with associated security background checks having been undertaken. All cars are searched prior to being allowed to enter the undercroft and this takes approximately 5 minutes per car. It is necessary for commercial vehicles relating to TV broadcasting, catering and medical services to enter the undercroft area before each match. Again, no commercial vehicles are allowed into the undercroft unless the vehicle and occupants have been pre-registered and background checked. These vehicles are also searched prior to entry and are required to arrive at least 3 hours prior to the start of the match.

- 9.24 No large vehicles such as coaches are allowed to enter the undercroft unless they have been subject to a search of sufficient detail to mitigate any risk associated with a vehicle of that size. The MPS Counter Terrorism Search Team have advised that a search of a coach that is equivalent to that undertaken for each car (which takes 5 minutes per car) would take a team of 6 trained officers approximately 2 hours to complete for each coach.
- 9.25 As a comparison, during the London Olympics in 2012, searches of coaches by expertly trained military and police search teams took upwards of 16 minutes per coach. However, all coaches allowed to access Olympic venues were fully registered under the VAPP (Vehicle Accreditation and Parking Permitted) system operated by LOCOG (London Organising Committee of the Olympic & Paralympic Games) and had arrived from a designated 'clean area' such as the Athlete's Village or main Media Centre. The VAPP system has been specifically designed to provide registered vehicles with timely access through a checkpoint that other vehicles would not be allowed through. Any vehicles arriving at Olympic venues without the correct VAPP paperwork were turned away at a permit check point located at least 500m away from the venue.
- 9.26 Evidently, it would not be practically possible to stop and manually search up to 24 coaches prior to entry into the Stadium undercroft due to associated time and resource (number of trained officers and dogs required) constraints. Therefore, consideration has been given to the feasibility of potentially screening coaches using high tech scanning equipment.
- 9.27 The evolution of high energy scanning equipment in recent years has seen the ability for goods and materials to be searched rapidly and remotely. The use of X-ray scanning has enabled good quality images to be used to identify threats across a wide range of applications and for a range of purposes. In all situations the scanning equipment must be utilised by a specially trained operator and the threat or risk identified by a specialist team that are appropriately trained to know how to react to any situation that may occur.
- 9.28 Any threat that is identified as a result of the scan is invariably isolated in order to allow a manual search that can determine the appropriate action. The scan is not a search, it provides only an indication that there is an item of potential risk on board a vehicle. The risk must then be assessed and actioned by specialist trained personnel in an environment that removes risk from the public.
- 9.29 In order to undertake this search a specialist team needs to be established and operated according to appropriate accreditation and training. This is particularly

resource heavy and requires a dedicated team able to work in short shift patterns that reflect the intensity of the search role.

9.30 High energy scanning equipment cannot be used on occupied vehicles. (For HGVs a low energy, safe 'CabScan' approach is used that switches automatically to high energy to search trailers). In order to scan coaches with high energy, it is a safety requirement for passengers to be disembarked prior to the scan. The other option is to use a low energy scanning system.

9.31 The use of low energy scanning systems is much safer for individuals, and can operate to high levels of detail in modern equipment. However, it is important to note that the scan is not a search and therefore must be carried out in conjunction with a specialist trained search team to identify and react to any suspect images. Coaches cannot be searched with passengers onboard, therefore, in order for a coach to be searched it would be necessary for the passengers to disembark.

9.32 Consequently, no system exists that would enable spectator coaches to enter the Stadium undercroft direct, with no pre-search and with passengers remaining on board. In order to park coaches under the Stadium, whilst maintaining the safety and security of the Stadium building and fans the following would be required:

- The disembarkation of spectators from coaches at a location away from the Stadium screening area. Two segregated locations would be required for home and away fans.
- The establishment of a search / screening location, off of the public highway, which coaches would enter in advance of the Stadium undercroft (this was located 500m away from venues at the Olympics).
- The ability to bypass cars around coaches, due to the discrepancy in search times. This would require the provision of a minimum of two entrance lanes.
- The operation of a rejection lane for manual searches of coaches should suspect images be found on the scanning equipment. This would therefore mean the requirement of a third lane which leads back away from the Stadium.

9.33 In addition to the need to significantly redesign the Stadium entrance and surrounding roads to accommodate additional separate entry lanes, search areas and bypass lanes, the requirement to undertake searches on coaches prior to entrance into the Stadium undercroft would require significant amendments to the Stadium and local area operations. These operational changes would be necessary to maintain the safety of spectators and prevent significant increased impacts on local residents, businesses, and traffic flows on the surrounding highways. The changes to operational requirements that would be associated with parking coaches within the Stadium undercroft are described in detail in the paragraphs below.

9.34 At least two on street locations would need to be identified and agreed within close proximity to the Stadium where spectators travelling on coaches would be dropped off. Two locations are required in order to achieve appropriate segregation of home

and away fans. The drop off locations would ideally be sited in locations that are easily accessible from the strategic highway network and would need to be long enough to accommodate a number of coaches, as coaches carrying away fans have a tendency to travel together and arrive in groups of 3-4 coaches.

- 9.35 The coaches would need to arrive within a one hour window between two hours before kick off, when the Stadium opens to the public, and one hour before kick off, so as to avoid road closures and allow spectators sufficient time to comfortably get to their seats before the start of the game. Roads around the Stadium are closed, for the safety of spectators walking to the Stadium, one hour prior to kick off, so coaches would not be able to reach the Stadium after this time.
- 9.36 Prior to kick off, the roads surrounding the Stadium are congested. Therefore, coaches would need to arrive sufficiently early so as to avoid getting caught in the congestion and missing the short one hour window which would allow access to the Stadium and the scanning / searching area.
- 9.37 Each coach would need to wait at a drop off location for a minimum of 5 minutes to allow passengers to disembark. Each drop off location would need to be managed by stewards or police officers to prevent spectators from loitering in the area and to prevent anti-social behaviour and public disorder. The drop off locations would need to be on the left hand side of the carriageway (for the direction the coaches would arrive from), so as to avoid unloading spectators into the road. However, for coaches arriving from Europe, the locations would need to be on the right side of the carriageway. In either case, the drop off locations would be difficult to manage without a road closure, and would be likely to cause traffic congestion as a result of fans over spilling into the carriageway.
- 9.38 Once coaches have dropped off their passengers they would then be able to approach the designated screening area. As described above, the screening of coaches prior to entering the Stadium undercroft could be subject to an electronic scan with a subsequent manual search for any coaches which register suspect images during scanning. The length of time taken for each coach to pass through scanning and potential searches would be determined by the findings of the scan. It would only be possible to scan and search one coach at a time, therefore, coaches would need to queue to be scanned and searched. If a suspect image was registered by the scan, therefore requiring a further manual search, this would cause potential significant delays to the scanning of further coaches and the movement of coaches, cars and any other vehicles into the Stadium undercroft. Given the lack of available space on roads around the Stadium, coaches waiting to be scanned, would cause substantial congestion and would result in an inability to clear the highway prior to the commencement of road closures around the Stadium.
- 9.39 To summarise, the scanning of a vehicle whether electronically or manually, is undertaken to identify items of risk. The identification of these items following a scan requires manual investigation of that item by a team of specialists. To undertake this search, the vehicle should be isolated in order to avoid risk to the public. In an area of limited space such as the approach to the Stadium undercroft, this manual assessment would require the suspension of access to the undercroft

for all vehicles for the duration of the search. The impact of this operation would therefore be widespread and substantial.

### Post Match Departure

- 9.40 Following the end of a match, the roads immediately surrounding the Stadium are heavily congested with fans and the exit from the Stadium car park is closed 15 minutes before the final whistle. Therefore, coaches parked within the Stadium undercroft would need to have left the Stadium and be at their passenger pick up locations prior to the final whistle. As an example, assuming 10 coaches were parked in the Stadium undercroft and that an average of 5 minutes manoeuvring time was allowed for each coach to clear the Stadium undercroft, then coaches would need to start departing at least 50 minutes before the final whistle (matches are generally last a minimum of 105 minutes).
- 9.41 Passenger pick up locations would need to be sufficiently large, so as to be able to accommodate all of the coaches that had parked within the Stadium undercroft at the same time. Therefore, they would need to provide the same level of coach parking capacity as has been provided for the past 8 football seasons and is proposed under this current application. In a similar manner to the drop off locations described above, it would be desirable that the pick-up locations would allow spectators to gather on the footway prior to boarding their coach as opposed to within the carriageway, which would impact on traffic flow and highway safety. Separate pick up locations would be required for European spectators' coaches unless the pick up locations were contained within a road closure area.
- 9.42 All spectators would need to be picked up from the location where they were dropped off prior to the match, otherwise, it would be likely to result in significant confusion for spectators trying to find their coach, thereby delaying the departure of spectators, providing increased likelihood of anti-social behaviour and public disorder in the areas around the Stadium.

### Summary

- 9.43 The above paragraphs set out the various logistical and management issues that would be associated with the parking of coaches within the Stadium undercroft, taking into account the design of the Stadium, the requirements of the Stadium Safety Certificate, and the advice provided by the MPS Counter Terrorism Unit with respect to security requirements. Each one of these challenges, taken on their own, mean that the parking of coaches within the Stadium undercroft would result in significant negative impacts on highways and the amenity of local residents. Of particular note, is the fact that the Stadium is not designed to accommodate significant public access direct from the undercroft and could not simply be re-designed to allow this to happen, due to emergency evacuation requirements that prohibit the provision of further turnstile access from the undercroft. Consequently, it would be necessary to provide coach passenger drop off and pick up locations which would effectively replicate the issues caused by the agreed coach parking locations for the past 8 seasons and proposed under the current application. However, there would be added noise, disturbance and highways impacts associated with the additional coach movements, in the areas surrounding the

Stadium, which would increase negative impacts on neighbours and ultimately be counter productive.

- 9.44 It is considered that the issues, set out above, clearly illustrate that it is not at this current time (or in the medium term going forward) practically possible to provide coach parking within the Stadium undercroft, and it is unlikely that this situation will change in the near future. Further to these issues, it is also important to note that the advice provided by the MPS Counter Terrorism Security Unit. Their advice that spectator coaches should not be parked in the Stadium undercroft has remained consistent from 2005 until present. This position was further confirmed in a letter to the council in February 2012 and remains the same – “There has been no reduction in the threat levels since this was last reviewed and thus the recommendation is that there should be no coach parking under the stadium on a match day.”
- 9.45 Taking into account that it is not currently (or in the medium term going forward) practically possible to secure coach parking within the Stadium undercroft, it is necessary to ensure that appropriately controlled and managed coach parking is provided, in accordance with the MPS operational needs, at other locations outside the Stadium. The proposed coach parking locations for the 2014/15 season and beyond are individually discussed in the sections below.

### **Proposed Locations**

- 9.46 The four main differences between the last two seasons coach parking arrangements and this application are as follows:
- Hornsey Road has been added as a new coach parking location to be used second in order of priority after Queensland Road;
  - The Sobell Centre has been moved from the second to the third priority location;
  - Drayton Park is no longer proposed as a coach parking location;
  - AFC are seeking a permanent permission for the proposed coach parking arrangements.
- 9.47 All locations, apart from the Sobell Centre, provide on-street coach parking. However, the sites have been selected with a view to allowing public safety to be maintained in accordance with the operational requirements of the MPS.
- 9.48 As required by the Local Area Management Plan (LAMP), AFC stewards would be present at all the designated coach parking locations that are required to be used for each match, from four hours before the scheduled start of the match to the start of the match, and from the end of the match until all coaches have departed. The AFC stewards would carry-out the following functions at each of the designated coach parking locations:
- Coordinate the parking of coaches;

- Assist with the manoeuvring of coaches;
- Record the number of coaches;
- Advise drivers to switch off engines and air-conditioning once coaches are parked;
- Direct spectators and drivers to portable toilets as required;
- Manage the behaviour of spectators and direct them quickly towards the Stadium or back onto their coach after the game;
- Remind coach drivers and passengers to be respectful of residents and their property and to conduct themselves appropriately;
- Provide general advice and assistance to coach drivers and spectators as required;
- Inform drivers and passengers that they must return to the coach as soon as reasonably practical following the end of the match;
- Advise drivers to only switch on engines immediately prior to departure; and
- Coordinate the departure of coaches.

9.49 The number of stewards to be deployed at each site for each match day, would be determined by operational requirements, for example: the number of coaches allocated to use the site on that match day, and whether the coaches are carrying home or away supporters.

9.50 The spectator coach parking locations proposed for the 2014/15 season and beyond (and their order of priority) are set out below in Table 5. However, it is necessary to note that the order of priority in which the sites are used would remain dynamic as determined by the operational requirements of the MPS based on the intelligence which they receive on a match-by-match basis.

**Table 5 – Proposed coach parking sites for 2014/15 season and beyond**

Order of Priority	Coach Parking Location	Capacity (No. of Coach Parking Bays)
1	Queensland Road	18
2	Hornsey Road	9
3	Sobell Centre	12
4	Hornsey Street	11 (not used more than twice per season)
5	Finsbury Park	90+ (only used in exceptional circumstances)

- 9.51 Details of the proposed arrangements at each proposed coach parking location and an assessment of the associated impacts at each location are set out in the sections below.

### **Queensland Road**

- 9.52 Queensland Road, is a cul-de-sac with a single entrance from Benwell Road. The carriageway has been realigned as part of the Queensland Road redevelopment, which forms part of the wider Arsenal regeneration programme. Planning permission (ref: P082018) was granted for this phase of the development in July 2009. Development of the south side of Queensland Road has been completed and is occupied. The development of the north side of Queensland Road is well progressed and is partly occupied. The north side development is due to be fully completed ready for occupation by the end of 2015.
- 9.53 Queensland Road has been used as the first priority location for coach parking for all 8 football seasons since the Emirates Stadium opened in 2006, due to its convenient location immediately adjacent to the Stadium. Consequently, spectators carried by coaches parked at Queensland Road would have less than a 5 minute walk between their coach and the turnstile entrances to the Stadium accessed from the Stadium podium. Therefore, it is proposed that Queensland Road would continue to be used as the first priority location for coach parking, as requested by the MPS.
- 9.54 If Queensland Road was to continue to operate as the first choice location for coach parking, it is predicted that it would be used to provide coach parking for all football matches played at the Stadium. Based on the number of games in previous seasons, this is likely to be between 26 and 31 times per football season.
- 9.55 It is proposed that Queensland Road would provide parking capacity for a total of up to 18 coaches, utilising both sides of the carriageway, while maintaining the necessary access for emergency vehicles to access the Stadium and the Queensland Road development if so required.
- 9.56 Coaches entering Queensland Road would be directed by stewards to the coach turning head at the end of the road, where the coaches would be turned around to face the exit from Queensland Road onto Benwell Road for ease of departure. Once turned around, the coaches would be directed, via a carefully choreographed sequence of parking, into allocated bays that order parking, so as to ensure the most effective use of available space and to ensure operations are as efficient as possible.
- 9.57 The departure of coaches from Queensland Road would be determined by the MPS based on operational requirements at the time. However, this is likely to be within 30 minutes from the end of the match, within the period that road closures are still in place, but after spectator movement around the Stadium has dropped off from the post match peak.
- 9.58 Subject to appropriate management in line with the controls set out in the LAMP, it is considered that the continued use of Queensland Road (which is located within



a match day road closure) for match day coach parking would not have a significant detrimental effect on the operation of surrounding highways.

#### Impact on Residential Amenity

- 9.59 The redevelopment of Queensland Road is now partly occupied and moving rapidly towards completion. This development comprises high density residential blocks, which on completion will provide a total of 729 residential properties. Consequently, the continued use of Queensland Road for coach parking could potentially result in noise and disturbance for an increased number of neighbouring residents on match days.
- 9.60 However, when assessing the potential impacts of continuing to provide on-street coach parking on Queensland Road, on existing and future residents of Queensland Road, it is necessary to take into account the fact that the Stadium has been completed and in operation since 2006, and Queensland Road has been used to provide coach parking for all 8 football seasons that AFC have played at the Emirates Stadium. Therefore, it is considered reasonable to expect that anyone deciding to move to a residential property on Queensland Road, has when making that decision, been fully aware that they are choosing to live next to a 60,000 capacity football stadium, with all the noise and disturbance associated with the operation of the stadium (including coach parking). The principle of parking coaches on Queensland Road as the first priority location is well established, having operated on this basis for the past 8 football seasons.
- 9.61 Furthermore, the impact on residential amenity which coach parking would have, needs to be considered in the context of the overall level of match day noise and disturbance likely to be experienced by residents of properties located immediately adjacent to the Stadium.
- 9.62 As required by the LAMP, AFC stewards would marshal spectators disembarking and embarking coaches at Queensland Road, directing them to the Stadium or back onto their coaches. Stewards would also advise drivers to switch off their engines and air-conditioning once coaches are parked. These actions would minimise the potential for noise and disturbance associated with coach parking on Queensland Road in as far as is practically possible.
- 9.63 On match days, parking bays on Queensland Road (many of which are for blue badge holders) would be suspended and these spaces would be re-provided within the basement parking area that forms part of the Queensland Road north side development (and temporarily with the Stadium undercroft until the basement parking at Queensland Road is available). Therefore, there would be no significant reduction in car parking capacity as a result of the coach parking on Queensland Road.
- 9.64 Overall, taking into account that match day coach parking is well established on Queensland Road (having operated for 8 football seasons), and the high level of noise and disturbance which residents on Queensland Road would experience on match days anyway, regardless of coach parking (due to the influx of 60,000 football fans into the local area), it is considered that subject to the operation of coach parking in strict accordance with the controls required by the LAMP, this

would not result in unacceptable harm to the amenity, safety or security of local residents.

### **Hornsey Road**

- 9.65 Hornsey Road (A103) runs north from Holloway Road passing adjacent to the west side of the Emirates Stadium. It is proposed to utilise a section of Hornsey Road to the northwest of the Emirates Stadium, located between the railway bridge and the cross-roads junction with Tollington Road to provide match day coach parking. It is proposed that the east side of this section of Hornsey Road would provide capacity to park up to 9 coaches.
- 9.66 This section of Hornsey Road is currently covered by the LAMP and is subject to match day parking restrictions to enable safe spectator movement in the carriageway prior to and immediately following matches. The suspension of on-street parking bays in this section of Hornsey Road has historically provided the MPS with a location to park a limited number of their match day support vehicles. However, the MPS have identified sufficient space beyond their operational requirements which can be used for the parking of match day spectator coaches.
- 9.67 This is the first time Hornsey Road has been proposed as a location for spectator coach parking. However, it is noted that this site was used a total of 9 times during the previous 2013/14 football season as directed by the MPS Match Day Commander. The management of coach parking on a match by match basis is at the discretion of the MPS Match Day Commander in the interests of public safety.
- 9.68 Hornsey Road is second in the order of priority for proposed coach parking locations as requested by the MPS. This location is favoured by the MPS, as it best enables them to control spectator movements between coaches and the Stadium, and allows the MPS to limit the interaction of spectators (arriving on coaches) with local residents, due to the close proximity to the Stadium entrances accessed from the surrounding podium. For this reason, the use of Hornsey Road is preferred by the MPS as the second priority over the Sobell Centre, which has been used as the second priority coach parking location for previous seasons.
- 9.69 Based on the data collected from previous seasons, it is predicted that if Hornsey Road was to be used as the second priority location for coach parking, it would be used approximately 14 times each season on average.
- 9.70 With regards the proposed parking layout, sufficient space would be provided between each coach to enable independent departure, although arrival sequences dictate that parking would occur first towards Tollington Road, then back towards the Stadium. Coaches would depart from Hornsey Road as soon as they are loaded with passengers and the on site stewards have determined that the levels of spectators in the adjoining carriageways have decreased to a level that is safe for the coaches to depart.
- 9.71 Subject to appropriate management in line with the controls set out in the LAMP, it is considered that the use of Hornsey Road (which is located within a match day road closure) for match day coach parking would not have a significant detrimental effect on the operation of surrounding highways.

### Impact on Residential Amenity

- 9.72 To the east of the proposed coach parking location on Hornsey Road is the Harvist Estate, which comprises a mix of low rise and high rise blocks of flats. There are also three storey residential terraces along the west side of Hornsey Road. Objections have been received from residents of the Harvist Estate.
- 9.73 AFC currently provide 3 stewards on Hornsey Road to manage spectators in this area and this is proposed to continue. This equates to one steward per 3 coaches. The stewards would ensure that the coaches park in the allocated spaces and that engines and air-conditioning are turned off as soon as viable and remain off while the coaches are parked.
- 9.74 Stewards would ensure that spectators proceed directly to the Stadium once they have disembarked without loitering on Hornsey Road outside the Harvist Estate, and would prevent spectators from trying to enter the Harvist Estate for any reason both on arrival and departure.
- 9.75 The use of Hornsey Road was first trialled as a coach parking location for the Arsenal Vs Stoke City game in September 2013. The operation of the site before, during and after the game was closely monitored using cameras to allow an assessment of the associated impacts. The assessment of the camera observations undertaken concluded that there was no observable impact upon the Harvist Estate with all spectators observed as leaving their coach and walking immediately towards the Stadium. Similarly after the game, the stewards were seen to direct all the spectators back to their respective coaches with no observed impact upon the Harvist Estate or other neighbouring properties.
- 9.76 The residential blocks at the Harvist Estate which are closest to the proposed coach parking are set back approximately 18m from the carriageway on Hornsey Road and are orientated roughly perpendicular to Hornsey Road, presenting blank flank wall elevations towards the location where the coaches would be parked. The terraced residential properties located on the west side of Hornsey Road would be approximately 14m from the coaches parked on the opposite side of the road, and spectators would disembark the coaches on the far side from these properties. It is also necessary to note, that while Hornsey Road is a new coach parking location (proposed to be second in the list of priority of locations), the Sobell Centre has been used as the second priority coach parking location for the previous 8 football seasons with all spectators travelling between the coaches parked at the Sobell Centre and the Stadium being required to walk along Hornsey Road past the new proposed coach parking location.
- 9.77 In summary, it is considered likely that there would be an increased impact on the amenity of neighbouring residents, at the Harvist Estate and Hornsey Road, as a result of introduction of coach parking on Hornsey Road. However, taking into account the proximity of this location to the Stadium, and the existing unavoidable noise and disturbance caused by spectators travelling to and from the Stadium, along Hornsey Road on match days, it is not considered that the parking of coaches in this location would result in such additional harm to the amenity of neighbouring occupiers compared to previous football seasons, so as to be considered unacceptable.

## **Sobell Centre**

- 9.78 The Sobell Centre is a large multi-purpose public sports centre located on the corner of Hornsey Road and Tollington Road approximately 500m to the northwest of the Emirates Stadium. The main car park at the Sobell Centre has been used as the second priority location for coach parking for the previous 8 football seasons since the opening of the Emirates Stadium in 2006. Initially the Sobell Centre provided capacity for the parking of up to 18 coaches, but this was reduced to 12 coaches following the creation of two small sided-football pitches on part of the car park.
- 9.79 It is proposed that the Sobell Centre would continue to provide capacity for parking up to 12 coaches, but would be moved to third priority location for coach parking behind Queensland Road and Hornsey Road as requested by the MPS.
- 9.80 The Sobell Centre has been used on average 8 times per season in past seasons with a minimum usage of 6 times and a maximum usage of 12 times. Based on the data collected from previous seasons, it is predicted that if the Sobell Centre was to be used as the third priority coach parking location, it would be used at least 3 times each season on average.
- 9.81 The proposed coaches would enter the Sobell Centre from Hornsey Road on the west side and depart onto Isledon Road on the east side. It is considered that the additional 12 vehicle trips at the junction where coaches would enter the highway network would have a minimal impact on the operation of the highway as any queuing would occur within the Sobell Centre car park and not on the highway network.
- 9.82 The proposed parking layout within the Sobell Centre car park has been proved by testing to be the most efficient method of parking coaches within the available space. The sequence of parking is such that arriving coaches would be parked immediately without having to wait for passengers to disembark from the previous coach. This would ensure that there is no undue delay prior to the coach being able to switch off its engine. Similarly, on departure, the coach parking layout means that coaches can depart from the Sobell Centre as quickly and safely as possible without having to wait for the egress route to be clear of other parked coaches.
- 9.83 Coaches would depart from the Sobell Centre as soon as they are loaded with passengers and the on site stewards have determined that the levels of spectators in the adjoining carriageways have decreased to a level that is safe for the coach to depart. It is expected that 100% of coaches would depart within an hour following the end of a match.
- 9.84 Subject to appropriate management in line with the controls set out in the LAMP, it is considered that the use of the Sobell Centre for match day coach parking would not have a significant detrimental effect on the operation of surrounding highways.
- 9.85 The proposed parking layout at the Sobell Centre has been assessed by London Fire and Emergency Planning Authority and they concluded that the arrangements would not obstruct fire tender access to the Sobell Centre.

- 9.86 The total capacity of the Sobell Centre car park is 120 car parking spaces. These are all available for general public usage except the 12 bays closest to the entrance of the centre which are designed as 'mother and child' bays. 12 match day coach parking bays are set out to the east side of the car park and these are regulated by flip down signs that allow for coach parking only at the discretion of the MPS. The layout of the coach parking within the Sobell Centre car park has been designed to accommodate the maximum number of coaches within the smallest possible space, in order to minimise the impact upon available car parking spaces for sports centre users. On match days when the Sobell Centre is used to provide capacity for coach parking, the number of car parking spaces available to the public is reduced to 75.
- 9.87 A car parking survey undertaken at the Sobell Centre, on several dates during February 2014, indicates that there is an underlying demand for car parking spaces by sports centre users and local residents / businesses of between 40 and 60 spaces during the day. However, this level of demand is obviously dependent upon whether sports events are being held at the centre, with weekend morning events for children appearing to attract a high level of parental support and associated parking demand. Consequently, it is considered that the retention of a supply of 75 publicly available parking spaces is sufficient to meet the demands of sports centre users, provided they are not taken up by spectators travelling to the Emirates Stadium.
- 9.88 The survey does indicate that on match days large numbers of the parking spaces are taken up by spectators travelling to the Emirates Stadium and on games where the Sobell Centre is not required for coach parking, the extra capacity is taken up by spectator demand, thereby significantly restricting the number of parking spaces available for sports centre users. However, as a sufficient number of car parking spaces are retained to meet the background demand on days when the Sobell Centre is used for coach parking, it is not the coach parking, but rather the use of the car park by spectator's cars which is more of an issue. This could simply be resolved by restricting access to the car park for spectators' cars on match days as part of the management of the Sobell Centre.
- 9.89 In summary, it is not considered that the reduction in publicly available car parking spaces, as a result of the use of part of the Sobell Centre car park for coach parking on a limited number of occasions (predicted to be approximately 3 occasions per football season), would unacceptably impact on Sobell Centre users, local residents or local businesses. Furthermore, there would be no loss of income to the Sobell centre as a result of coach parking as AFC would be charged for the use of the car park.

#### Impact on Residential Amenity

- 9.90 As stated by the Inspector in his appeal decision (para. 21), most of the dwellings in the vicinity of the Sobell Centre are either relatively remote from the parking spaces and those that are closest, present flank walls to the parking area.
- 9.91 Detailed arrangements for the management of spectator coaches at the Sobell Centre are set out in the LAMP (Local Area Management Plan) that forms part of the overarching Stadium Management Plan (SMP) for football matches held at the

Emirates Stadium. The MPS also have an operational plan, which they keep updated.

- 9.92 For previous seasons AFC have provided 4 on-site stewards to manage the arrival and departure of spectators from the Sobell Centre when it is booked to capacity. This equates to one steward for every 3 coaches. This would continue under the current proposals. The stewards present when the Sobell Centre is used, act to speed the movement of arriving spectators towards the Stadium, and the departure of coaches away from the site after the match, as well as to control the behaviour of spectators where required.
- 9.93 Match day coach parking is well established at the Sobell Centre, having operated for 8 football seasons. The current proposals would result in a significant reduction in the number of times this site would be used for coach parking thereby significantly reducing any impact on the amenity of neighbouring residents and the likelihood of anti-social behaviour compared to that experienced in previous seasons. Consequently, it is considered that subject to the operation of coach parking in strict accordance with the controls required by the LAMP, this would not result in unacceptable harm to the amenity of local residents.

### **Hornsey Street**

- 9.94 Hornsey Street is a cul-de-sac with a 7m wide carriageway located to the southwest of Holloway Road (A1). To the southwestern end of the road is a mini-roundabout, which provides vehicular access to the Islington Waste Recycling Centre. Hornsey Street is located approximately 500m to the southwest of the Emirates Stadium and is outside the match day traffic restriction zone.
- 9.95 The northwest side of Hornsey Street was previously designated for the parking of up to 13 coaches and has been used as a third / fourth priority location for coach parking for the past 8 football seasons since the Emirates Stadium opened in 2006. It is proposed to continue to use the northwest side of Hornsey Street as the fourth priority coach parking location, providing capacity to park up to 11 coaches on match days. The use of Hornsey Street would be limited to a maximum of twice per football season, unless otherwise needed to meet the operational requirements of the MPS.
- 9.96 The MPS support the use of Hornsey Street for spectator coach parking for high risk matches when it is deemed necessary to have segregation of coaches carrying home and away supporters or when the first three priority sites have reached capacity. However, this is on the basis that Hornsey Street should only be used to park home supporter coaches, in order to minimise the risk of public disorder, due to the fact that Hornsey Street is further away from the Stadium than the first three priority locations, and requires spectators to cross the A1 Holloway Road. Spectators walking between coaches on Hornsey Street and the Stadium can safely cross Holloway Road using the signal controlled crossing facilities at the Holloway Road / Hornsey Street / Hornsey Road junction.
- 9.97 Hornsey Street has not been used for the past four football seasons and has been used a maximum of 3 times in any one past season. On average Hornsey Street has been used less than once per season. The use of Hornsey Street has been

restricted by condition for the last 5 football seasons to not more than twice per season. AFC have confirmed that they are willing to accept a condition which would continue to limit the use of Hornsey Street to a maximum of two times per football season unless otherwise required by the MPS (Condition 2). Based on analysis of the data for past seasons it is predicted that Hornsey Street would be used twice for each season going forward.

- 9.98 Traffic flows along Hornsey Street are relatively light. Nonetheless, a high proportion of the traffic on Hornsey Street comprises refuse vehicles and other trucks associated with the operation of the Islington Waste & Recycling Centre (WRC) which is located at the far (west) end of Hornsey Street.
- 9.99 The busiest periods of operation for the WRC are weekday mornings and to a lesser degree weekend mornings. These times, therefore, do not coincide with times when matches are played at the Emirates Stadium. Spectator coach parking on Hornsey Road has not resulted in significant disruption to traffic on Hornsey Street on the occasions when this has taken place during previous football seasons.
- 9.100 Information provided by London Waste showed that approximately 6 articulated lorry movements associated with the WRC occur during the weekend and the last vehicle normally leaves Hornsey Street at 2pm. There is a small chance that arriving coaches on weekend matches may coincide with these lorry movements. However, to mitigate this scenario, a passing bay, which can accommodate the largest articulated lorry using Hornsey Street, has been provided to ensure two-way vehicle flow of large vehicles is maintained.
- 9.101 Access to Hornsey Street for spectator coaches is directly from Holloway Road which is part of the Transport for London Road Network (TLRN). On arrival, coaches would be directed towards the west end of Hornsey Street where they would make a U-turn around the mini-roundabout and park along the north side of the carriageway. This would allow passengers to disembark onto the footway and ensure coaches are facing the correct direction ready for a quick departure after the match.
- 9.102 The mini-roundabout at the west end of Hornsey Street has a diameter of 15m which is insufficient for 12m long coaches to turn around in one movement. Therefore, coaches are required to make a three-point turn at the mini-roundabout. It is noted that TfL have raised some concerns regarding the requirement for coaches to do a three-point turn at the mini-roundabout and the impact this would have on highway safety. However, the mini-roundabout is not part of the TLRN, and taking into account the proposed limited use of Hornsey Street (not more than twice per football season), the Council's Transport Officer has raised no objection to its use as third priority coach parking location.
- 9.103 The Holloway Road / Hornsey Street junction is controlled by signals with separate filter lanes for vehicles turning left and those either turning right or heading straight. It is not envisaged that there would be coaches queuing to leave Hornsey Street after the match and it is considered that the additional vehicle trips are minimal and would not have a material impact on the Holloway Road / Hornsey Street junction

and traffic flow on the surrounding streets. It is expected that all coaches parked on Hornsey Street would depart within an hour from the end of the match.

- 9.104 On the occasions when Hornsey Street is required for spectator coach parking it would be necessary to suspend approximately 30 on-street parking bays. Therefore, when Hornsey Street is considered likely to be required for match day coach parking, the MPS would notify the Council of the requirement to suspend the parking bays, at least 14 days in advance of the match. Plates would be attached to parking bay suspension signs on Hornsey Street indicating the date of the next match and the requirement to suspend the bays, at least 10 days prior to the match where possible. One day before the match is due to take place, special signs would be revealed clearly indicating the suspension of parking bays on Hornsey Street. Cones would be placed along the relevant sections of Hornsey Street to reinforce no waiting and loading restrictions during the morning of the match day.
- 9.105 In instances where the full 11 coach capacity is not required, the layout of the coach parking would be rearranged to minimise the impact on servicing of ground floor commercial uses and the number of car parking spaces available on Hornsey Street.
- 9.106 Given the fact that Hornsey Street would only be used for the parking of coaches up to twice per football season (unless further needed as a result of MPS operational requirements), subject to appropriate management in line with the controls set out in the LAMP, it is considered that the proposal would not have an unacceptable impact on parking or the safe operation of the highway.

#### Impact on Residential Amenity

- 9.107 Large scale development on either side of Hornsey Street forms part of the wider 'Arsenal on the Move' regeneration programme. The buildings on Hornsey Street are generally large, range up to 12 storeys in height, and comprise commercial uses at ground floor level with residential units on the upper floors.
- 9.108 It is noted that residential properties on Hornsey Street are generally located on the upper floors of buildings with commercial uses at ground floor level, therefore, this would significantly reduce the impact on the residential amenity compared to a situation where there were ground floor residential units with a direct facing relationship with parked coaches.
- 9.109 It is noted that there are several properties on Hornsey Street where prior approval has recently been granted for the conversion of ground floor commercial properties to residential use under permitted development rights. However, when assessing the potential impacts of continuing to include Hornsey Street, as an on-street coach parking location, on residents of new ground floor level residential units on Hornsey Street (created under permitted development), it is necessary to take into account the fact that Hornsey Street has been included within the list of coach parking locations for all 8 previous football seasons that AFC have played at the Emirates Stadium. Therefore, the principle of parking coaches on Hornsey Street is well established and the impact on residents would not increase from that of previous seasons.



- 9.110 The LAMP sets out the strategy and details with regards the management of coach parking on Hornsey Street. For previous seasons AFC have provided up to 4 on-site stewards to manage the arrival and departure of coaches and spectators from Hornsey Street, when it is booked to capacity. This approximately equates to one steward for every 3 coaches. This would continue under the current proposals. The stewards present when Hornsey Street is used, act to speed the safe movement of arriving spectators towards the Stadium, and the departure of coaches away from the site after the match, as well as to control the behaviour of spectators where required.
- 9.111 Given the fact that Hornsey Street would only be used for the parking of coaches up to twice per football season (unless further needed as a result of MPS operational requirements) and would only be used to park coaches carrying home supporters, subject to appropriate management in line with the controls set out in the LAMP, it is considered that the proposal would not have an unacceptable impact on the amenity of local residents.

### **Finsbury Park**

- 9.112 Finsbury Park is a large public open space providing facilities for a wide variety of formal and informal sports and activities. Finsbury Park is located just outside the borough within the London Borough of Haringey. The park has been used for all previous 8 football seasons to provide additional coach parking capacity in exceptional circumstances and it is proposed that this would continue for the 2014/15 season and beyond.
- 9.113 On the infrequent occasions when Finsbury Park is required for spectator coach parking, AFC will contact Haringey Council Parks Department to make arrangements for the use of the Park. Haringey Council have agreed in writing that this is acceptable.
- 9.114 AFC have confirmed that they are willing to accept a condition limiting the use of Finsbury Park to exceptional circumstances only, as has happened for 8 previous football seasons played at the Emirates Stadium (Condition 3).

### **Impact on Residential Amenity**

- 9.115 Finsbury Park has been used for the parking of coaches on exceptional circumstances, not numbering more than 3 times per season for the past 8 football seasons. It is considered that the continuation of this situation would not result in significant harm to the amenity of local residents.

### **Planning Obligations, Community Infrastructure Levy and local finance considerations**

- 9.116 Approval of coach parking arrangements for the approaching 2014/15 and 2015/16 football seasons is subject to the applicant entering into a S106 legal agreement to cover the following matters:
- Operation of the coach parking scheme to cover football (soccer) matches for the 2014/15 and 2015/16 seasons;

- Restrictions to the use of the Hornsey Street parking location to not more than twice per football season unless required by the MPS;
- The coach parking arrangements to form part of the updated Local Area Management Plan and Monitoring Programme and also acknowledged in the Stadium Travel Plan;
- Traffic Management Order – The costs of preparation and implementation of any Traffic Management Order (if needed) to be covered by AFC;
- Maintenance works for the Sobell Centre car park - The costs of any maintenance works or repair to the car park (if needed) to be covered by AFC;
- Match day signage; and
- The scheme of coach parking locations and the practical mechanics of their operation on match days

9.117 This would replicate the requirements of the legal agreement which was entered into for the preceding seasons and which was before the Inspector at the public inquiry planning appeal in July 2009.

## **10. SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION**

- 10.1 The current temporary two year permission for coach parking in relation to football matches at the Emirates Stadium expires at the end of the 2013/14 season. Therefore, agreement of coach parking arrangements for the up coming 2014/15 season and beyond is necessary.
- 10.2 The Inspector stated in his reasoning (para. 16 of the appeal decision), *'It may be highly desirable to all concerned to agree a long term solution to coach parking in association with use of the stadium. It may also be preferable that all or most of the provision should be off-street and controlled by Arsenal FC. Those are not however requirements of the amended condition.'*
- 10.3 It is considered there is a need to be pragmatic in deciding how best to deal with a situation which is not ideal but which needs to be carefully managed. It is important to understand that if an agreement on coach parking arrangements cannot be reached prior to the commencement of the rapidly approaching 2014/15 football season, this will not prevent coaches carrying football supporters from arriving at the Emirates Stadium and surrounding roads on match days. In a scenario where there is no agreement on coach parking locations, the MPS would handle the coaches as they see fit, in line with their operational requirements so as to maintain public safety and prevent public disorder.
- 10.4 It is apparent from the volume and content of objections received from local residents (as a result of public consultation) that despite implementation of the

mitigation measures promoted by the LAMP, operation of coach parking arrangements over previous seasons have been detrimental to residential amenity, particularly in terms of noise and disturbance and visual impact. However, provided the switching off of coach engines and the disembarkation and embarkation of spectators is strictly controlled at each location by stewards, it is considered that these impacts could be significantly mitigated. Being realistic, it is clear that it would not be possible to eliminate these impacts, but the impacts associated with coach parking, need to be assessed in light of the existing unavoidable noise and disturbance that occurs in the local area surrounding the Stadium on match days as a result of the influx of 60,000 spectators travelling to and from the Stadium.

- 10.5 Based on data collected over past seasons, it is anticipated that there will continue to be a requirement to provide capacity for parking a minimum of 40 spectator coaches to accommodate demand generated by matches played at the Emirates Stadium, with the occasional requirement for greater capacity if AFC progress through the rounds of cup competitions. However, it should be noted that any future exceptional coach parking demand can be accommodated at Finsbury Park as confirmed by Haringey Council.
- 10.6 The predicted frequency of use of each coach parking location is set out below in Table 6. However, it is necessary to note that the actual priority of use of these sites would be determined by the MPS on a match to match basis and therefore these numbers are only indicative.

**Table 6 – Frequency of use of designated coach parking locations – all home matches**

Location	Frequency of Use		
	2013/14	Predicted 2014/15	Difference
Queensland Road	31	31	0
Hornsey Road	9	14	+5
Sobell Centre	6	3	-3
Hornsey Street	0	2	+2

- 10.7 Queensland Road has been successfully used to park coaches for the past 8 football seasons since the Emirates Stadium opened in 2006. It would continue to accommodate the parking of up to 18 coaches on all match days following the completion of the on-going developments.
- 10.8 Hornsey Road, due to its proximity to the Stadium, offers the best option for coach parking after Queensland Road, in terms of meeting the operational preferences of the MPS, with regards their key aim of maintaining public safety and minimising opportunities for public disorder. This location was trialled for the match where Arsenal played Stoke City in September 2013. Observations of the operation and management of the coach parking on Hornsey Road for this match indicate that the

proposed level of stewarding on Hornsey Road would be sufficient to efficiently manage coach parking and effectively deter anti-social behaviour in the area, thereby minimising the potential impact upon residents of the Harvist Estate and other neighbouring properties.

- 10.9 The Sobell Centre has been successfully used to park coaches for the past 8 football seasons since the Emirates Stadium opened in 2006. It would continue to operate as a location providing capacity for the parking of up to 12 coaches on match days, but would be moved down from second priority to third priority location. If utilised as the third choice location, it is predicted that use of the Sobell Centre would be significantly reduced from the average of 8 times per football season recorded over previous seasons to just 3 times per season on average.
- 10.10 Hornsey Street has been an agreed coach parking location for the past 8 football seasons since the Emirates Stadium opened in 2006, although it has not been used for the past four seasons. Nevertheless, Hornsey Street has been successfully used for the parking of coaches in previous seasons and would continue as the fourth priority location with an expected usage of up to but no more than 2 times per season, to be restricted by condition.
- 10.11 Finsbury Park would continue to provide additional coach parking capacity in exceptional circumstances as has happened for the past 8 football seasons.
- 10.12 The proposed arrangements would continue to facilitate transport to the Stadium by means other than car-based transport, which accords with the reason why condition AG16 was imposed. The impact upon traffic flows and the displacement of parking as a result of the proposal would be limited to temporary periods on match days and is considered to represent the least harmful solution currently available. Having regard to the characteristics of each location, there are no significant safety concerns identified by consultees. This includes the consideration of pedestrian flows between the coach parking locations and the Stadium, which would be under controlled conditions provided by stewarding as specified in the LAMP. Overall, the proposal including the coach parking locations, numbers of parking spaces, the access and egress for coaches to and from these locations in the highway network, as well as pedestrian movements to and from the Stadium are considered to be a workable solution that could be accommodated within the highway network on match days.
- 10.13 Full and detailed arrangements for the management of spectator coach parking are set out in the LAMP (attached as Appendix 3), which is currently being updated prior to the commencement of the upcoming 2014/15 football season as required by the Stadium S106. It is essential that the mitigation measures, including stewarding of spectators and management of the impacts of coach parking, as set out in the LAMP, are maintained along with full monitoring of impacts.
- 10.14 The issues raised by objectors (increased traffic; traffic movements; temporary loss of residential parking; the volume of spectator crowds and pedestrian safety; noise and general disturbance from spectators and coaches; pollution from coach engines left running; litter; dirt and antisocial behaviour) are mitigated as far as is possible by the LAMP which is a requirement in the S106 legal agreement for the

Emirates Stadium. These and other amenity impacts raised by objectors are temporary and for a limited number of times during the football season.

- 10.15 In summary, it is considered that subject to the associated amenity and highways impacts being appropriately mitigated by the controls set out in the LAMP, the proposed coach parking arrangements, with locations set out in the order of priority as proposed, represent the best option currently available, which would present the least harmful and most practical solution to the on-going issue of match day coach parking requirements at this current time (and in the medium term going forward).
- 10.16 As noted by the Planning Inspector in his appeal decision, given the current reliance on locations for coach parking that are not under the control of AFC and the fact that circumstances will change (including the introduction of new residential occupiers at Queensland Road as the on-going development is finished and occupied), it is considered that it is appropriate to grant a temporary rather than permanent permission for the coach parking arrangements as sought under this application.
- 10.17 A temporary permission would necessitate submission of a future application thereby allowing continuing up-to-date monitoring and review of associated amenity and highways impacts, so as to ensure the least harmful coach parking arrangement is able to be pursued. This approach would potentially allow for the possibility of other locations and different orders of priority of the current locations to be explored in the future.
- 10.18 In light of the above, it is concluded that subject to conditions restricting the use of Hornsey Street to no more than two uses per football season and limiting the use of the locations to the next two football seasons, and subject also to the mitigation measures required by the S106 Agreement, the proposal would comply with the relevant policies within the Islington Development Plan (as set out in Appendix 2) and the NPPF. Therefore, it is considered that the proposals would represent the best available solution to satisfy the requirements of condition AG16 during the next five football seasons up until the end of the 2018/19 season.
- 10.19 The conclusion that the proposed coach parking arrangements are considered to be acceptable is a decision made on balance, taking fully into account the advice provided by the MPS Counter Terrorism Unit, who have made it clear that the parking of coaches within the Stadium undercroft remains unacceptable on public safety grounds for the current time and the medium term going forward. This conclusion also takes into account the unacceptable additional highways impacts of the necessary security and safety measures associated with the parking of coaches within the undercroft in a scenario where this would be allowed by the MPS Counter Terrorism Unit subject to appropriate searching of coaches.

## **Conclusion**

- 10.20 It is recommended that planning permission be granted on a 2 year temporary basis subject to conditions and S106 legal agreement heads of terms as set out in Appendix 1 - RECOMMENDATIONS.

# APPENDIX 1 – RECOMMENDATIONS

## RECOMMENDATION A

That approval of details be granted for coach parking arrangements in relation to condition AG16 of planning permission ref: P061170, for a temporary period of 1 football season (2014/15) to cover all home football (soccer) matches, subject to the prior completion of a Deed of Planning Obligation made under section 106 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 between the Council and all persons with an interest in the land (including mortgagees) in order to secure the following planning obligations to the satisfaction of the Head of Law and Public Services and the Service Director, Planning and Development / Head of Service – Development Management or, in their absence, the Deputy Head of Service:

1. Operation of the coach parking scheme to cover football (soccer) matches for the next 2 football seasons – 2014/15 & 2015/16;
2. Restrictions to the use of the Hornsey Street parking location to not more than twice per year unless required by the MPS;
3. The coach parking arrangements to form part of the updated LAMP and Monitoring Programme and also acknowledged in the Stadium Travel Plan;
4. Traffic Management Order – The costs preparation and implementation of any Traffic management Order (if needed) to be covered by Arsenal Football Club;
5. Maintenance works for the Sobell Centre car park - The costs of any maintenance works or repair to the car park (if needed) to be covered by AFC;
6. Match day signage; and
7. The scheme of coach parking locations and the practical mechanics of their operation on match days

That, should the **Section 106** Deed of Planning Obligation not be completed within 13 weeks / 16 weeks (for EIA development) from the date when the application was made valid, the Service Director, Planning and Development / Head of Service – Development Management or, in their absence, the Deputy Head of Service may refuse the application on the grounds that the proposed development, in the absence of a Deed of Planning Obligation is not acceptable in planning terms.

ALTERNATIVELY should this application be refused (including refusals on the direction of The Secretary of State or The Mayor) and appealed to the Secretary of State, the Service Director, Planning and Development / Head of Service – Development Management or, in their absence, the Deputy Head of Service be authorised to enter into a Deed of Planning Obligation under section 106 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 to secure the heads of terms as set out in this report to Committee.

## RECOMMENDATION B

That the grant of planning permission be subject to **conditions** to secure the following:

### List of Conditions:

1	<b>Approval of coach parking locations only for a 2 year temporary period</b>
	<p>CONDITION: Unless otherwise approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority under condition AG16 of P011500 (as amended by P052891), use of the locations for coach parking hereby permitted shall be discontinued on or before the end of the 2015/16 football (soccer) season.</p> <p>REASON: In order that the amenity and highways impacts associated with the operation of the approved coach parking arrangements can be monitored and reviewed with a view to ensuring that the optimum coach parking solution is achieved going forward.</p>
2	<b>Restriction on use of Hornsey Street</b>
	<p>CONDITION: Coach parking at Hornsey Street shall be limited to not more than twice per football season, unless increased usage is required by the Metropolitan Police Service, in consultation with the London Borough of Islington, for safety and/or security reasons.</p> <p>REASON: In order to balance the requirements to provide adequate match day coach parking capacity, to maintain public safety, to maintain residential amenity, and to minimise highways impacts.</p>
3	<b>Restriction on use of Finsbury Park</b>
	<p>CONDITION: Coach parking at Finsbury Park shall be limited to exceptional circumstances only.</p> <p>REASON: In order to balance the requirements to provide adequate match day coach parking capacity, to maintain public safety, to maintain residential amenity, and to minimise highways impacts.</p>
4	<b>Order of Priority</b>
	<p>CONDITION: The coach parking locations hereby agreed shall be used in the approved order of priority as set out below unless a different order of priority is required by the Metropolitan Police Service, in consultation with the London Borough of Islington, for safety and/or security reasons.</p> <p>1 - Queensland Road (18 spaces) 2 - Hornsey Road (9 spaces) 3 - Sobell Centre (12 spaces) 4 - Hornsey Street (11 spaces) 5 - Finsbury Park (90+ spaces only to be used in exceptional circumstances)</p> <p>REASON: In order to balance the requirements to provide adequate match day coach parking capacity, to maintain public safety, to maintain residential amenity,</p>

	and to minimise highways impacts.
5	<b>Approved drawings and documents</b>
	<p>CONDITION: The development hereby approved shall be carried out in strict accordance with the following approved documents:</p> <p>Emirates Stadium Coach Parking Arrangements – 2014-15 Season Onwards by Steer Davies Gleave dated October 2013</p> <p>REASON: To comply with Section 70(1)(a) of the Town and Country Act 1990 as amended and the Reason for Grant and also for the avoidance of doubt and in the interest of proper planning.</p>

**List of Informatives:**

1	<b>S106</b>
	<p>SECTION 106 AGREEMENT</p> <p>You are advised that this permission has been granted subject to a legal agreement under Section 106 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990.</p>



## **APPENDIX 2: RELEVANT POLICIES**

This appendix lists all relevant development plan policies and guidance notes pertinent to the determination of this planning application.

### **1 National Guidance**

The National Planning Policy Framework 2012 seeks to secure positive growth in a way that effectively balances economic, environmental and social progress for this and future generations. The NPPF is a material consideration and has been taken into account as part of the assessment of these proposals.

### **2. Development Plan**

The Development Plan is comprised of the London Plan 2011, Islington Core Strategy 2011, Development Management Policies 2013, Finsbury Local Plan 2013 and Site Allocations 2013. The following policies of the Development Plan are considered relevant to this application:

#### **A) The London Plan 2011 - Spatial Development Strategy for Greater London**

Policy 6.1 Strategic approach	Policy 7.1 Building London's neighbourhoods and communities
Policy 6.2 Providing public transport capacity and safeguarding land for transport	Policy 7.2 An inclusive environment
Policy 6.3 Assessing effects of development on transport capacity	Policy 7.3 Designing out crime
Policy 6.10 Walking	Policy 7.5 Public realm
Policy 6.11 Smoothing traffic flow and tackling congestion	Policy 7.13 Safety, security and resilience to emergency
	Policy 7.14 Improving air quality
	Policy 7.15 Reducing noise and enhancing soundscapes
	Policy 8.1 Implementation
	Policy 8.2 Planning obligations

#### **B) Islington Core Strategy 2011**

Policy CS2 (Finsbury Park)  
Policy CS3 (Nag's Head and Upper Holloway Road)  
Policy CS8 (Enhancing Islington's Character)  
Policy CS18 (Delivery and infrastructure)

## **C) Development Management Policies June 2013**

**DM2.1** Design

**DM6.1** Healthy development

**DM8.1** Movement hierarchy

**DM8.2** Managing transport impacts

**DM8.3** Public transport

**DM8.4** Walking and cycling

**DM8.5** Vehicle parking

**DM8.6** Delivery and servicing for new developments

**DM9.1** Infrastructure

**DM9.2** Planning obligations

**DM9.3** Implementation

## **D) Site Allocations June 2013**

Site Allocation HC5

### **5. Designations**

The site has the following designations under the London Plan 2011, Islington Core Strategy 2011, Development Management Policies 2013, Finsbury Local Plan 2013 and Site Allocations 2013:

- Queensland Road: Site Allocation HC5, Highbury Corner & Holloway Road Key Area;
- Hornsey Road: Local Flood Risk Zone;
- Sobell Centre: Nags Head & Upper Holloway Road Key Area, Local Flood Risk Zone;
- Hornsey Street: Protected Vista – Alexandra Palace to St Paul's Cathedral

### **7. Supplementary Planning Guidance (SPG) / Document (SPD)**

The following SPGs and/or SPDs are relevant:

#### **Islington Local Plan**

- Planning Obligations and S106

